

point out weaknesses in particular case reports). Krippner also cautions against types switching into areas for which they are not suited (such as an Analytical Scientist doing theoretical work, etc.).

The 1983 convention appeared to be a successful one. One particularly hopeful sign was the continued involvement of skeptics in the convention, an involvement which can only increase communication and lead to a more rational dialogue between the two "camps." *Research in Parapsychology, 1983* is a well-organized volume; certainly the grouping of papers by topic rather than by presentation order and the initiation of the category of "interim reports" are very helpful improvements.

DOUGLAS M. STOKES

1030 Wyndon Avenue
Bryn Mawr, PA 19010

THE ENIGMA OF DANIEL HOME: MEDIUM OR FRAUD? by Trevor H. Hall. New York: Prometheus Books, 1984. Pp. 148. \$16.95, cloth.

The reader of Trevor Hall's above-mentioned book who has already studied D. D. Home's phenomena will very soon come to the conclusion that Hall is not quite fair with regard to the manner in which he deals with the subject. It is obvious that he commenced writing his book with the conviction that Home was a fraudulent medium and that therefore every phenomenon he was said to have produced had to be of a fraudulent nature. According to Hall, all psi manifestations are impossible and thus nonexistent.

Hall's point of view may be quite right. But it seems to me that it is an unscientific approach to ignore every report or communication concerning ostensible paranormal phenomena and print only cases that seem to support his hypothesis that psi is a product of mere imagination. Below we will give an example of the procedure he uses to support his hypothesis, fooling his readers at the same time.

In the spring of 1855, Home (22 years old) arrived in London and stayed at Cox's Hotel for several weeks. Mr. Cox, the owner of the hotel, was much impressed by Home's mediumship. He invited Lord Brougham to have a sitting with Home. Lord Brougham requested Sir David Brewster, in those days a well-known scientist, to accompany him in order to discover any trick the medium might apply. When Sir David returned home that evening he, with all his impressions still fresh in his mind, wrote in his diary, dated June 1855: "Last of all I

went with Lord Brougham to a *séance* of the new spirit-rapper, Mr. Home, a lad of twenty, the son of a brother of the late Earl of Home" (p. 23). Higher up on this same page Hall quoted that Mr. Maskelyne (in his book *Modern Spiritualism*, London, 1875) had remarked that Sir David Brewster, in a letter, had declared that he considered Home to be a fraud.

On the other hand, Hall forgot to mention the fact (though he must have known it) that Sir David had written something quite different in his diary directly when he arrived home after attending the *séance* in Cox's Hotel. Here follows what Sir David noted down in his diary, describing the events and phenomena he witnessed that day in the course of the sitting with Home as the medium:

The four of us seated ourselves at a table of normal dimensions. We were invited to examine the structure of the table. After a few minutes the table started to vibrate, the vibration passing on up our arms. This vibration stopped or started again according to our commands. Raps, that were absolutely inexplicable were heard from various parts of the table which was completely levitated and floated in the air, without a hand touching it. Another table was brought in, but also with this table the same movements of levitation were observed by those present.

Somewhat later a handbell was placed on the carpet that covered the floor. After remaining there quietly during some moments it started to tinkle without a hand touching it. Somewhat later the bell was placed on the carpet at the other side of the table. From here it came towards me and settled down in my hand. It acted in the same manner with Lord Brougham. These were the most important phenomena. We were not able to explain what happened, or to imagine what kind of instrument had produced the phenomena.

(Mrs. Gordon, *The Home Life of Sir David Brewster*.
Edinburgh, 1869, pp. 57-58)

Another example of the curious manner in which Hall deals with his question of whether Home was "an authentic medium or just a fraudulent one" is the following case:

On page 31 he writes: "Home stayed in the house of the wealthy Rufus Elmers . . . Here he was visited by the poet William Cullen Bryant, B. K. Bliss, William Edwards and David A. Wells, all from Harvard." But Hall did not say a word about the purpose these five gentlemen had in visiting Home. If he had done so he would probably have blown to pieces his hypothesis that Home was a fraudulent medium. That purpose was to investigate Home's claim to be an authentic medium of great power. What these five gentlemen ascertained was described in a report they published:

The table was pushed with such great strength against each one of us that we were moved away from the spot where we were seated, and that over a distance of several feet. Edwards and Wells gripped the table with all the strength they possessed, but the invisible energy that was exercised in the opposite direction neutralized the strength of the two named. Mr. Wells now seated himself on the table that at that time was shaken with great strength, and which finally was raised on two legs, remaining in this position during thirty seconds. When this happened nobody touched the table.

Three gentlemen, Wells, Bryant and Edwards, seated themselves simultaneously on top of the table, and while these men were so seated, the table started to move in various directions. After some time the table was seen to rise completely from the floor and floated about in the air during several seconds, as if something more solid than air was upholding it.

Now and then we heard a loud "bang," which brought about a vibration of our room's floor. This vibration resembled that caused by a loud peal of thunder, or a far-off artillery bombardment that caused the table, the chairs and other furniture in the room, as well as ourselves to vibrate in such a manner that the trembling could not only be felt but also seen.

Finally we wish to point out that Mr. Home several times insisted that we hold his hands and feet. The room was all the time well illuminated, and the lamp was often placed on the table as well as under the table, giving us every opportunity to inspect the table-top, and also what was going on under the table.

We have to declare "that we have the certainty that we were not imposed upon and neither were we the victims of optical illusions."

On p. 14 Hall states: "Home's friendship with Adare is pivotal to any examination of the former's mediumship." This is not true, for the conditions prevailing at hundreds of Home's sittings, many of which may be considered test sittings, cannot be compared with the conditions met with during the time Home and Adare lived together. Two such test séances which it seems Hall never heard of are to be found in the following two articles:

E. J. Dingwall (1953). Psychological problems from a report on psychokinesis. *British Journal of Psychology*, **44**, 61-69.

G. Zorab (1970). Test-sittings with D. D. Home at Amsterdam (1858). *Journal of Parapsychology*, **34**, 47-66.

G. ZORAB

Schoutenhoek 240
2722 Zoetermeer
Holland